BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03867 9338

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

David Beatty

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Spring 1994

Prepared with the assistance of Sylvia Davis and Jo Anne Frenschkowski

KF
8
742
.994

KF - 5865
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
NOV 18 1993
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

David Beatty

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Spring 1994

Prepared with the assistance of Sylvia Davis and Jo Anne Frenschkowski

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/comparativeconst00beat_0

Contents

I INTRODUCTION

D.P. Kommers, "The Value of comparative Constitutional Law", 9 John Marshall Journal of Practice and Procedure, 685, p. 691-4 . . . . . I-1

M. Cappelletti, The Judicial Process in Perspective, Chapt. 3 . . . . . I-4

D.M. Beatty, "Duties and Deference: The Universal Rules of Human Rights Law", DRAFT (1993) University of Toronto, Faculty of Law, ... I-12

II RELIGION

Lee v. Weisman, 112 S.Ct. 2649 (1992) II-1

Employment Division, Dept. of Human Resources of Oregon v. Smith, 110 S.Ct. 1595 (1990) II-6

Edwards Books and Art v. Queen (1986) 35 D.L.R. (4th) 1 . . . . . II-13

Bijoe Emmanuel v. The State of Kerala A.I.R. 1987 S.C. 748 . . . . . II-33

M.H. Quareshi v. The State of Bihar A.I.R. 1958 S.C. 731 . . . . . II-37

The Faith Healing Case (Nishida v. Japan), Itoh, Hiroshi and Beer, Lawrence W., The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions 1961-70 Univ. of Washington Press (1978) p. 223-226 . . . . . II-43

Kjeldsen, Busk Madsen and Pedersen v. Denmark, Series A, Volume 23, 7 Dec. 1976 . . . . . II-51

Blood Transfusion Case (1971) in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press 32 BVerGE 98 . . . . . II-56

School Prayer Case (1979) in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press 52 BVerGE 223 . . . . . II-59

III ASSOCIATION

A. POLITICAL ASSOCIATION

The United States Civil Service Commission v. The National Association of Letter Carriers 413 U.S. 548, 93 S.Ct. 2880 (1973) III-1

Osborne v. Canada (Treasury Board) 82 D.L.R. 4th, 321 (1991) III-10

Kameshwar Prasad v. State of Bihar A.I.R. 1962 S.C. 1166 . . . . . III-17

Balakotaiah v. The Union of India A.I.R. 1958 S.C. 232 . . . . . III-22

The Court Worker Incitement Case (1969) in The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions 1961-70 Itoh and Beer Eds., at p. 103. . . . . III-24

"No Political-Activity" Clause in an Employment Contract in Court and Constitution of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions, 1948-60 Maki, John M., (1964) Univ. Washington Press p. 282. . . . . III-33

Kosiek v. Germany (1986) 9 EHRR 328 . . . . . III-34

The Civil Servant Loyalty Case in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press p. 323; (1975 39 BVerGE 334 . . . . . III-39

B. ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Abood v. Detroit Board of Education 431 U.S. 207 (1977) III-42

Lavigne v. Ontario Public Service Employees Union, 81 D.L.R. (4th) 545 (1991) III-50

Professional Institute of Public Service of Canada v. Commissioner of the Northwest Territories, 72 D.L.R. (4th) 1 (1990) III-64

Damyanti v. Union of India, A.I.R. 1971 S.C. 966 . . . . . III-67

All India Bank Employees v. National Industrial Tribunal, A.I.R. 1962 S.C. 171 . . . . . III-70

Toyama v. Japan (1966) The Tokyo Central Post Office Case, in Itoh, Hiroshi and Beer, Lawrence W., The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions 1961-70 Univ. of Washington Press (1978) p. 85 . . . . . III-77

Young, James and Webster v. The United Kingdom, 1981 4 E.H.R.R. 38 . . . . . III-85

National Union of Belgian Police v. Belgium, (1975) 1 E.H.R.R. 578 . . . . III-93

The Codetermination Case, in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press p. 278, (1979) 50 BVerGE 290 . . . . . III-97

The Worker's Chamber Case, [1978] 1 I.L.L.R. 27-33; (1974) BVerGE 281 . . . . . III-101

IV EXPRESSION

A. HARMFUL EXPRESSION

R.A.V. v. City of Paul, 112 S.Ct. 2538 (1992) IV-1

R. v. Butler, (1992) 89 D.L.R. (4th) 449 . . . . . IV-18

Ranjit D. Udeshi v. State of Maharashtra, A.I.R. 1965 S.C. 881 . . . . . IV-26

Lady Chatterly's Lover Case, from Court and Constitution in Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions 1948-60, ed. Maki, John M., pp. 3-37, (1964) IV-31

Handyside v. The United Kingdom (Note), European Court of Human Rights, Ser. A., Vol. 24, Dec. 7, 1976 . . . . . IV-39

Muller v. Switzerland, (1991) 13 E.H.R.R. 212 . . . . . IV-42

The Mephisto Case, in: The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press IV-48

B. COMMERCIAL EXPRESSION

S.U.N.Y. v. Fox 109 S.Ct. 3028 (1989) IV-56

Irwin Toy v. A.-G. Quebec, (1989) 58 D.L.R. (4th) 577 . . . . . IV-61

Hamdard Dawakhana v. Union of India A.I.R. 1960 S.Ct. 554 . . . . . IV-74

Ono v. Japan (The Moxa Advertising Case), in The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions, 1961-70, eds. Itoh, Hiroshi, and Beer, Lawrence Ward, p. 217 (1978) IV-80

Markt Intern and Beerman v. Germany (1990) 12 E.H.R.R. 161 . . . . . IV-84

The Press Advertising Case 21 BVerGE 271 (1967) IV-93

C. ACCESS RESTRICTIONS ON MEANS OF EXPRESSION

Society for Krishna Consciousness v Lee 112 S.Ct. (1992) IV-98

Committee for the Commonwealth of Canada v. Canada 77 D.L.R. (4th) 385 . . . . . IV-112

Himat Lal v. Police Commissioner, Ahmedabad A.I.R. 1973 S.Ct. 87 . . . . IV-131

Tokyo Ordinance Decision, Hanrieshu, XIV, No. 9, 1243 (Criminal 1985), in Court and Constitution of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions, 1948-60 Maki, John M., (1964) Univ. Washington Press p. 84-166 . . . . . IV-139

Platform Arzte fur das Leben v. Austria 13 EHRR 204 (1988) IV-147

3rd Television Case in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press57 BVerGE 295 (1981) IV-150

V LIFE, LIBERTY AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON:

Roe v. Wade 93 S.Ct, 705 (1973) 410 U.S. 113 . . . . . V-1

Morgentaler, Smoling and Scott v. The Queen 44 D.L.R. (4th) 385 . . . . . V-11

Death Penalty Case Hanreishu, II, No. 3, 1991 (Criminal) V-47

Mithu v. State of Punjab AIR 1983 Supreme Court 473 . . . . . V-51

Open Door Counselling and Dublin Well Woman v. Ireland 15 E.H.R.R. 244 (1992) V-58

West German Abortion Decision Feb 25/75 39 BVerGE 1 reported in (1976) 9 John Marshall Journal of Practice and Procedure 605 . . . . . V-71

VI EQUALITY

Regents of University of California v. Bakke, 438 U.S. 265 (1978) VI-1

Michael M. v. Superior Court of Sonoma County, 450 U.S. 464 (1981) VI-14

Andrews v. Law Society of British Columbia, (1989) 56 D.L.R. (4th) 1 . . . . VI-19

R. v. Hess; R. v. Nguyen, [1990] 6 W.W.R. 289 . . . . . VI-35

Deepak Sibal v. Punjab University, A.I.R. 1989 S.C. 903 . . . . . VI-47

Atam Prakash v. State of Haryana, A.I.R. 1986 S.C. 859 . . . . . VI-53

The Patricide Case in Murphy, Walter F., and Tannenhaus, Joseph, Comparative Constitutional Law Cases and Commentaries, St. Martin's Press, (1977), p. 359 . . . . . VI-59

The Joint Income Tax Case (Japan), in Murphy, Walter F., and Tannenhaus, Joseph, Comparative Constitutional Law Cases and Commentaries, St. Martin's Press, (1977) p. 342 . . . . . VI-65

Abdulaziz, Cabales and Balkandali v. United Kingdom, (1984) 7 E.H.R.R. 471 . . . . . VI-66

Dudgeon v. United Kingdom, (1981) 4 E.H.R.R. 149 . . . . . VI-74

The Joint Income Tax Case (Germany) in Murphy, Walter F., and Tannenhaus, Joseph, Comparative Constitutional Law Cases and Commentaries, St. Martin's Press, (1977) p. 339 . . . . . VI-84

The Homosexuality Case, in Murphy, Walter F., and Tannenhaus, Joseph, Comparative Constitutional Law Cases and Commentaries, St. Martin's Press, (1977) p. 351 . . . . . VI-87

VII VOTING RIGHTS

Reynolds v. Sims, 377 U.S. 533 (1964) VII-1

Re Reference: Electoral Boundaries Commission Act (1991) 81 D.L.R. (4th) 16 . . . . . VII-10

The Koshiyama Malapportionment Case (Koshiyama v. Chairman, Tokyo Metropolitan Election Commission. 1964) In The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions, 1961-70, eds. Itoh, Hiroshi, and Beer, Lawrence Ward, p. 53 (1978) VII-21

Mathieu-Mohin and Clerfayt v. Belgium, (1988) 10 E.H.R.R. 1 . . . . . VII-24

Apportionment Case II, in: The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press, p. 192 (1963 BVerGE 130) VII-33

VIII SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC RIGHTS

A. RIGHT TO AN EDUCATION

Meyer v. Nebraska, 262 U.S. 390 . . . . . VIII-1

Bartels v. State of Iowa, 262 U.S. 404 . . . . . VIII-3a

Wisconsin v. Yoder, 406 U.S. 205 . . . . . VIII-4

Mahe v. Alberta, 68 D.L.R. (4th) 69 . . . . . VIII-12

Re Kerala Education Bill, A.I.R. 1958 S.C. 956 . . . . . VIII-23

Textbook Fee Case, in Itoh, Hiroshi and Beer, Lawrence W., The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions 1961-70 Univ. of Washington Press (1978) p. 147-8 (Katō v. Japan, 1964) VIII-40

Re Belgian Language in Education, (1968) 1 EHRR, p. 252 . . . . . VIII-42

Numerus Clausus Case, 1 in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press p. 295, 33 BVerGe 303 (1972) VIII-56

B. RIGHT TO PURSUE A LIVELIHOOD

Lochner v. New York, 198 U.S. 45 . . . . . VIII-62

Lee Optical v. Williamson, 348 U.S. 483 . . . . . VIII-68

Black v. Law Society of Alberta, 58 D.L.R. (4th) 317 . . . . . VIII-70

R.M.D.C. v. The State of Maharastra, A.I.R. 1957 S.C. 628 . . . . . VIII-78

Sumiyoshi v. Governor of Hiroshima, in Murphy, Walter F., and Tannenhaus, Joseph, Comparative Constitutional Law Cases and Commentaries, St. Martin's Press, (1977) pp. 285 . . . . . VIII-80

Traktörer Aktiebolag v. Sweden, (1991) 13 EHRR 309 . . . . . VIII-87

Pharmacy Case, in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press, 7 BVerGE 377 . . . . . VIII-93

C. THE RIGHT TO PHYSICAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL WELL-BEING

Shapiro v. Thompson, 394 U.S. 618 . . . . . VIII-97

Tetrault-Gadoury v. U.I.C., 81 D.L.R. (4th) 358 . . . . . VIII-108

Olga Tellis, A.I.R. 1986 S.C. 180 . . . . . VIII-113

Ashai Tuberculosis Case, (Ashai v. Japan) in Itoh, Hiroshi and Beer, Lawrence W., The Constitutional Case Law of Japan: Selected Supreme Court Decisions 1961-70 Univ. of Washington Press (1978) p. 130-147 . . . . . VIII-126

Airey v. U.K., 8 E.C.H.R. 42 (1977) VIII-136

Aircraft Noise Control Case, in The Constitutional Jurisprudence of the Federal Republic of Germany, Kommers, Donald P., (1989) Duke Univ. Press p. 317; 56 BVerGE 54 (1981) VIII-143

APPENDIX

The Constitution of the United States of America App-1

The Constitution of Canada App-3

The Consitution of India App-10

The Constitution of Japan App-18

European Convention of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms App-22

Text of the Basic Law of the Federal Republic of Germany App-28